



Belgique
partenaire du développement



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Mid-Term Programme Evaluation: "Promoting Inclusive Development for People with Disabilities in the West Bank (Palestine)" April 2020

Tanja Kern and Dr. Saed Dorra
Neumuenster and Ramallah
16 April 2020

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

APEFE	Association pour la Promotion de l'Education et de la Formation à l'Etranger
BASR	Bethlehem Arab Society for Rehabilitation
CBR	Community Based Rehabilitation
CC	Community Center
DPO	Disabled Peoples Organization
GS	Gaza Strip
GUPD	General Union of Persons with Disabilities
LGUs	Local Governance Units
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoEHE	Ministry of Education and Higher Education
MoL	Ministry of Labor
MoSD	Ministry of Social Development
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MoWA	Ministry of Women Affairs
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
oPT	occupied Palestinian Territory
PA	Palestinian Authority
PCBS	Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics
SHG	Self-Help Group
SWOT	Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats
ToC	Theory of Change
UN-CRPD	United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
UNWRA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees
WB	West Bank

This report reflects the point of view of the evaluators, which does not necessarily match that of A.P.E.F.E. and the other technical and/or financial partners.

I. SUMMARY SECTION

A mid-term evaluation of the project "Promoting Inclusive Development for People with Disabilities in the West Bank (Palestine)", commissioned by APEFE, was carried out from October to December 2019. The project is being implemented from January 2017 to December 2021 and has a total budget volume of EUR 2.250.000 EUR.

In Palestine, despite existence of inclusive policies and a commitment to a human rights-based approach, persons with disabilities face many barriers to meaningful participation and inclusion. Due to the political situation in Palestine, coherent systems, approaches and services are lacking. A multitude of actors are involved in offering essential services (e.g. education), including UNWRA and Non-Governmental Organizations. The quality, consistency, connectedness and sustainability of services are affected by this reality. Negative community attitudes towards disability as well as the inaccessible infrastructure remain key barriers to inclusion.

The project "Promoting Inclusive Development for People with Disabilities in the West Bank (Palestine)" addresses existing barriers towards the full inclusion and meaningful participation of persons with disabilities, using a twin-track approach. Direct service provision is still dominant while mainstreaming disability in community development needs further strengthening.

The Theory of Change of the project including its underlying assumptions remain very relevant. The success of the project is hindered by the lack of political will and negative community attitudes. Mainstreaming of children and young adults with disabilities into regular education and livelihood opportunities remains challenging. Concerted efforts in terms of advocacy, awareness campaigns and pilot initiatives demonstrating replicable promising practice will be needed to progress. Involved stakeholders need to focus and align their efforts to achieve progress towards inclusive development.

The quality of project implementation at community level should be closely monitored to further optimize outcomes during the second phase of the project. BASR's newly introduced database is an effective tool for capturing client- and service-related information, cross-referral and follow up.

As BASR is working with independent community actors, some recommended actions are beyond the direct control and will require negotiation, advocacy and buy-in.

Terminology used in the logical framework should be further clarified and quality standards agreed upon. Additional qualitative indicators should be included in regular progress monitoring by all involved stakeholders.

It is recommended:

- To revisit and further define concepts, expected outcomes and behavioral change
- to add agreed qualitative indicators within BASR internal monitoring routines

- to introduce a Peer Review + Disability Activist Mechanism to monitor implementation of concepts and expected outcomes (including the above-mentioned qualitative indicators)
- to fill the Education Coordinator position which is key in coordinating and cooperating with the Community Center Network
- to increase alignment between, support and quality assurance of Community Centers
- to ensure effective monitoring of safeguarding standards within the framework of the project including a functioning feedback and complaint mechanism.

Within the context of this project, Community Centers play an essential role. In close cooperation with CBR Workers, the centers ensure persons with disabilities are identified and have increased access to information and opportunities. In terms of access to education and livelihood opportunities, Community Centers offer services to persons with disabilities who have been denied access to other educational, training and support opportunities (e.g. regular schools, special education facilities, vocational training). Most vulnerable groups like persons with severe or multiple disabilities are however not yet served by the community centers. By providing education and (pre-) vocational training, the project aims to enable children and young adults to be mainstreamed and have better access to opportunities in their communities at a later stage. A number of clients, however, remain at the Community Centers. The approaches and standards of Community Center vary substantially. Currently, however, all Community Centers still focus on direct service provision. Promising practices in terms of reverse integration and provision of inclusive education at Community Centers exist and need to be strengthened and utilized. The role of Community Centers in mainstreaming children with disabilities into regular services needs to be clarified and strengthened. Capacities of Community Center staff need to be increased; both for their role in provision of inclusive services and for their role in mainstreaming children with disabilities. An increased focus on family- and community-based opportunities is going to be required to avoid quasi-sheltered employment solutions, which increase the risk of further manifesting social exclusion.

BASR needs to strengthen its advocacy regarding inclusive approaches and continue its empowerment of Community Centers to optimize outcomes. The Community Centers, being independent actors, will need to be convinced that despite their challenging situation efforts to mainstream disability and safeguard vulnerable clients need to be continued, strengthened and formalized.

The education and pre-vocational training being offered within the framework of the project, need to be reflected in terms of their relevance towards increased livelihood opportunities of persons with disabilities. Some analysis and recommendations are beyond the direct accountability of the project implementers but should be used for reflection and further development of the project.

It is recommended:

- To start a strategic dialogue involving all Community Centers and to set up an annual "Peer Review"¹-mechanism to foster exchange, networking and

¹ From evaluation team perspective, BASR would be a key moderator of the process to keep it constructive and focused. The Peers would focus on both support and accountability. Some Peers are clearly further on the road

- peer support needed for the change process but also to create a certain level of peer pressure and accountability
- to increase the focus on mainstreaming disability (rather than direct service provision) and focus investments accordingly
 - to fill essential positions and ensure effective support of the Community Center Network as well as close follow up and quality assurance (i.e. Education Coordinator position)
 - to continue much needed capacity development of teachers in inclusive pedagogy and enable teachers to effectively support all children with disabilities
 - to design and implement a strategic pilot for mainstreaming disability in regular education and to share existing promising practice in terms of inclusive education services² at Community Centers
 - to strengthen BASR internal cooperation (e.g. Economic Empowerment Unit), effectively utilize all networks/ contacts and align advocacy
 - to increase dialogue with children/ youth as well as their families re. occupational interests. Develop realistic but ambitious career paths, preferably involving the relevant technical expertise (i.e. Economic Empowerment Unit).
 - To increase community engagement and start an internships/ work exposure initiative to increase chances for successful referral and access to livelihood.
 - To ensure reasonable accommodation for children at the center and in facilitated internship/ training/ employment.
 - to formalize safeguarding standards in every Community Center. The standards need to be clearly communicated to children, their families, all involved staff and visitors. All persons working with children should sign child safeguarding commitments.³

Organizational and financial sustainability of the Community Centers are limited. It is the duty of the Palestinian Authority to ensure every child has access to education. The reality however is that many children are denied access to the education system, which is neither accessible nor prepared to include children with (specific and/ or severe) disabilities. The Community Centers are trying to fill this gap by facilitating access to alternative educational services as well as to livelihood. Community Centers try to broaden their funding streams and create own income through projects. They try to reduce costs through utilizing support of volunteers. Without regular public funding support, centers will continue to struggle becoming sustainable. The quality of services is limited by the lack of adequate funding.

towards inclusion. The process would allow others to learn from existing strengths but they would be also held accountable to act based on learnings

² Currently there is limited inclusion but clearly, some CCs are trying to change their formerly special education settings towards more inclusive ones. This should be followed by all CCs. What we are referring to is a REAL pilot for inclusive education – in collaboration with public and/ or private schools. The role of CCs in such a pilot should shift towards enabling schools/ teachers to accept children with disabilities. Creating awareness of all actors (including parents and students) and ensuring a welcoming environment.

³ BASR`s CBR Team highlighted that safeguarding risks have been identified and were repeatedly discussed with the Community Centers. Various suggestions how to formalize related standards and processes within the Community Centers and in terms of defining such standards in the form of "BASR Partnership Criteria" were explored. Final decisions and actions are pending. The discussion should be finalized and formalized asap. Standards should include a Code of Conduct with clear sanctions for all actors with exposure to vulnerable communities (also including consultants).

It is recommended:

- To acknowledge the complexity of the situation, develop a realistic plan for acquisition of regular income (with a focus on public funding), focus investments/ efforts on implementation of plan.
- to increase concerted advocacy for Governmental support (national level, local municipalities and public service providers), using promising practice-models and putting pressure in cooperation with DPO`s.

The project addresses existing barriers through empowerment of persons with disabilities and their representative organizations and supporting self-advocacy.

BASR effectively targeted local municipalities and local councils to increase their support for inclusive community development. Promising practices of increased local ownership are visible and should be utilized to convince other Governmental stakeholders.

Roles, responsibilities of, and interfaces between the national umbrella organization General Union of Persons with Disabilities and local Disabled Peoples Organizations (DPO) are unclear and hinder an effective collaboration. Self-Help Groups (SHG) face power struggles and other hurdles related to group formation and management. Mutual expectations need revisiting; investments in empowerment of disability activists need to become more focused and strategic.

It is recommended:

- To identify high-potential individuals and groups for political advocacy (young, energetic, sufficient time resources) and invest in the development of their capacities. Ensure regular coaching and dialogue. Acknowledge key disability activists requiring a personal livelihood perspective (e.g. consider project-based paid roles).
- to start a strategic joint, concerted advocacy initiative (e.g. to support mainstreaming children in regular education, job initiative).
- to facilitate dialogue between political advocacy-oriented groups and GUPD. Agree on concerted advocacy with clear mutual expectations, roles and coordination (facilitated by BASR).

BASR is a recognized center of expertise in the field of medical services, rehabilitation and disability inclusion. Its departments are recognized for their technical expertise and experiences. The CBR Programme Team envisages to bundle its knowhow and resources in the form of a National Resource Center which offers expertise to local partners and communities. Interviewed key partners saw BASR`s core strength in its proximity to and knowledge/ data on communities and persons with disabilities in target communities. Decisions on most efficient and effective utilization of scarce capacities will be needed.

It is recommended:

- Highlight the key purpose and (targeted) users of the National Resource Center.
- Identify resources and services in realistic way (in line with capacities).

APEFE PALESTINE
Management Response

[External Midterm Evaluation 2019 for the project entitled "Promote Inclusive Development for Persons with Disabilities in the West Bank 2017-2021 funded by APEFE and implemented by BASR CBR Programme]

Date: 30 May 2020

Prepared by: Iyad Hamdan

Position: CBR Programme Manager

Evaluation recommendation 1: Monitoring and quality assurance of e.g. educational and vocational training, as well as the implementation of safeguarding standards, should be done regularly, systematically and involving technical experts.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: The community centres require further monitoring and quality assurance through developing regular follow up and supervision plan. Individual indicators will be better monitored via database, and community indicators will be developed to measure community ownership and accountability. Existing safeguarding standards will be further developed and formalized with the community centres. The CBR programme will seek expert consultations when needed for further development.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
1.1 Develop monitoring and supervision plan to ensure the quality of services rendered in the community centres.	September 2020	BASR/ CBR Programme and community centres.	The plan will start this year and will be part of the new strategy 2022-2026.	Initiated and will be regularly monitored.

Evaluation recommendation 2: Monitoring of community ownership and accountability should be done regularly, systematically and to identify and market promising practices that can be utilized for advocacy and replication.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: The CBR programme and in cooperation with the community centres will start developing indicators that measure the ownership and accountability of local communities towards disability rights and inclusion. The CBR programme has well-established individual progress measurement tool and needs to better formalize this tool at the community level. Some tools and surveys need to be better formalized and integrated into the database.

Key action(s)	Completion	Responsible	Tracking*
---------------	------------	-------------	-----------

	date		Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
2.1 Develop indicators for community accountability and ownership to be regularly monitored through the database.	December 2020	BASR/ CBR programme community centres and the disability movement.	The indicators will be jointly developed with the community centres in a strategic workshop in July 2020.	Initiated and will be regularly updated
2.2 Replicate promising practices implemented in community centres.	--	BASR/ CBR and community centres and the disability movement.	Inclusion of good practices needs to be more visible for better advocacy outcomes.	No due date

Evaluation recommendation 3: Basic qualitative indicators (outcome and behavioural change) should be developed in the form of indicator ladders, included in the database (client data OR group activities) and followed up

Management response: Agree

Explanation: The CBR programme has some tools and surveys, which aim at measuring the progress of disability ownership and inclusiveness at the community level. These tools target partner local municipalities and organizations. They need to be better formalized and integrated into the database to ensure constant monitoring and quality assurance.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
3.1 Develop indicators for community accountability and ownership to be regularly monitored through the database.	December 2020	BASR/ CBR programme community centres and the disability movement.	--	Initiated and will be regularly updated
3.2 Discuss gaps/ progresses on a regular basis.	--	BASR/ CBR programme community centres and the disability movement.	These indicators will be jointly and regularly reflected in the peer review mechanism.	Initiated and will be regularly reflected and monitored

Evaluation recommendation 4: Follow up on the implementation of agreed standards and foster a rights-based approach, learning-oriented, simple "Peer Review +"-mechanism involving peers and disability activists should be encouraged, using a standardized assessment questionnaire (referring to agreed ladders), identifying learning areas, promising practices and twinning opportunities.

Management response: Partially Agree

Explanation: CBR used to offer regular supervision and technical guidance for the community centres to ensure they are compliant with the right based

approach and inclusive development perspectives. CBR team has used to conduct monthly meetings with the admin and staff of the newly established community centres to discuss policy and practice levels that enhance functioning and promote inclusion. Mother groups were also established and empowered to act as peer support groups. These meetings were stopped due to the vacant position of the Education Officer. This mechanism will be reactivated including a representative from the disability movement to create a joint action for advocacy and inclusion.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
4.1 Re-establish the peer review mechanism with all partner community centres.	September 2020	Education officers, community centres staff, families' members and disability movement members.	Terms of reference for the groups will be developed and endorsed by members.	Initiated
4.2 Conduct regular meetings, document the outputs and follow up their implementation with relevant staff.	--	Education officers, community centres staff, families' members and disability movement representatives.	--	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 5: Ensure closer quality assurance and supervision in addition to increasing capacity development efforts, enabling staff and managers to meet expectations.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: 2 education professionals will join the CBR team to ensure better supervision and quality of outcomes in the community centres. The CBR team, community centres staff, and other relevant actors will develop supervision and development plan, which will be regularly monitored to measure the progress achieved.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
1.1 Recruit education professionals and develop a supervision plan to better monitor the quality of outcomes in community centres.	September 2020	CBR Programme and community centres.	On process and will be finished by the beginning of July 2020.	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 6: Fill vacant positions (i.e. Education Coordinator). Additional capacities and knowhow (e.g. of teachers) are required to ensure the quality of outcomes. In the meantime, consider introducing basic occupational health support-to-support, current staff.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: This position will be filled beginning of July 2020 with an extra assistant to make sure all the partner community centres receive adequate and quality supervision. The occupational health support will be discussed with the Mental Health Unit to be part of the intervention plan.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
6.1 Develop a job description and share it with the team and other professionals.	June 2020	BASR/CBR Programme	This task is done. The job description was consulted with BARR team and QUB team.	Initiated
6.2 Conduct job exams and interviews.	June 2020	BASR/CBR Programme	This task will be completed by the end of June 2020.	Initiated
6.3 Orient and train new employees on their roles in the programme.	July 2020	BASR/CBR Programme	This task will be completed by the end of July 2020.	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 7: Ensure a strategic dialogue on the role of community centres (Twin Track) and agreement on necessary changes. Develop "Indicator Ladders"; integrate into the database and monitor progress.

Management response: Agree

Explanations: The CBR seeks to advocate partner community centres to adopt a twin-track approach, which addresses the specific needs of persons with disabilities and mainstreaming. Adopting a right-based and twin-track approach to disability requires taking some measures including building the capacity of the staff and creating a welcoming environment for inclusion. CBR has developed and utilized several surveys and indicators in the past to measure the inclusiveness of disability at the community level while acknowledging integrated quality indicators in the database that is regularly checked and monitored will be a better tool to measure the desired change.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
7.1 Conduct a strategic review workshop for the community centres.	The workshop will be conducted in July 2020 and strategic discussions will be continued.	BASR/CBR programme, community centres, and disability movement representatives.	This strategic dialogue will start soon and will establish a framework for future partnerships and actions plans with the centres and relevant stakeholders.	Initiated
7.2 Develop quality indicators with the community centres to be integrated into the database and	The indicators will be developed and integrated into the database by the	BASR/CBR programme, community centres, and disability movement	The design and development of the indicators will require piloting, continuous review and development	Initiated

regularly monitored.	end of 2020.	representatives.	among all actors.	
7.3 Identify roles, and responsibilities between CBR programme and community centres, and endorse this strategy.	The approved strategy will start functioning in 2021.	BASR/ CBR programme, community centres, and disability movement representatives.	This agreement will shape the relationship with the centres in the future particularly in the new strategy 2022-2026.	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 8: Establish a confidential Feedback Mechanism for clients.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: Developing a confidential feedback mechanism is one of the CBR priorities in the new strategy 2022-2026. The programme is planning to develop an online interactive accountability section, which enables right holders to assess services, confidentially give feedback and file complaints. This will give a better insight over the existing gaps and will enhance the involvement of the right holders.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
8.1 Develop a web-based tool for accountability and feedback.	By the end of 2023	BASR/ CBR team, right holders, families, and partner organizations.	This recommendation is postponed for the new strategy 2022-2026.	No due date
8.2 Train right holders and monitor this system regularly.	By the end of 2023.	BASR /CBR programme.	This recommendation is postponed for the new strategy 2022-2026.	No due date

Evaluation recommendation 9: Formalize Safeguarding Standards at Community centres, create awareness and ensure effective follow-up.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: BASR has adopted a safeguarding policy in 2016 and taken some measures at institutional and community levels to ensure that target groups particularly children are protected and are not subject to any type of violence. The measures included raising the awareness of the staff and partners, revisiting the organization procedures and signing a code of conduct by all staff members and partner organizations. The CBR has offered several awareness-raising and prevention sessions for families, community centres, municipalities, and other organizations. However, this policy needs to be more compulsory and a criterion for the continuation of the partnership with all relevant stakeholders.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
9.1 Review and update safeguarding standards	--	BASR community	An external consultant might be hired to	Initiated

with the partner community centres.		programmes and community centres.	update the safeguarding standards.	
9.2 Endorse safeguarding standards and include them as an integral part of the partnership agreements with all partners.	2021/2022	BASR admin and Directors of the community centres.	These standards will be updated in 2021 and will be followed up in the new strategy 2022-2026.	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 10: Ensure ongoing and in-depth teacher training (pay attention to retention of trained staff!) in inclusive pedagogy.

Management response: Partially Agree

Explanation: CBR has focused on capacity development in 2017-2021 programme and many resources were invested to achieve this purpose. The community centres staff have received advanced trainings on pedagogy and inclusion. They were involved in the development of the research and support guides, which were developed with the Queen's University of Belfast. The commitment of the community centres staff has not been sufficient. The programme is planning to restructure the relationship with the community centres in the new strategy to ensure better outcomes. The retention of the staff is an overwhelming issue due to the lack of remunerations, incentives, and supportive working environment.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
10.1 Re-establish the partnership with the community centres based on clear commitments and responsibilities.	This plan will start in 2021	BASR/ CBR team and community centres.	This activity will start in 2021 and will be continued in the new strategy 2022-2026.	initiated
10.2 Nominate motivated and engaged staff to partake in the development plan.	This plan will start in 2021	BASR/ CBR team and community centres.	This activity will start in 2021 and will be continued in the new strategy 2022-2026.	initiated
10.3 Conduct capacity-building needs assessment, and measure progress.	This plan will start in 2021	BASR/ CBR team and community centres.	This activity will start in 2021 and will be continued in the new strategy 2022-2026.	initiated

Evaluation recommendation 11: Develop a pilot model for mainstreaming disability in regular schools including systematic support and follow up of regular schools/ students.

Management response: Partially Agree

Explanation: BASR/CBR programme has implemented several projects/ initiatives to promote inclusion in regular schools. The mainstream education system still needs further development and adaptation to welcome students with different types of disabilities/difficulties. This objective will remain one of the BASR/CBR priorities with further advocacy and support.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
11.1 Continue to advocate for the implementation of the inclusive education policy.	--	BASR/CBR, community centres and the disability movement.	Ongoing	No due date
11.2 Continue to create mainstreaming models and seek replication in different communities.	--	BASR/CBR, community centres and the disability movement.	Ongoing	No due date

Evaluation recommendation 12: Utilize and replicate promising practice models for reverse inclusion of children without disabilities in Community centres Education Families OR find other ways to increase the inclusiveness of service provision at the centres.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: Some of the community centres can apply reverse inclusion as they have kindergartens and basic education classes. This idea will be boosted to bring about positive changes for learners with and without disabilities.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
12.1 Boost this approach in the centres and replicate good models.	--	Community centres and CBR team	This approach is implemented in the centres but it needs to be better boosted and shared with other centres.	Initiated will be followed up regularly.

Evaluation recommendation 13: Revisit the roles and involvement of community centres in vocational training and employment. community centres should focus on facilitating and where required providing access to child-centred, professional education and pre-vocational training to enable as many children as possible to be referred to internal and external training and (self-)employment opportunities. CC`s should strengthen their mainstreaming efforts (rather than direct service provision) regarding vocational training and employment.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: This strategic approach is more effective and will better identify the roles of the centres in the community. It will also advocate the relevant

ministers mainly the Education and Labour to mainstream disability and strengthen referral practises. This requires further discussions and advocacy with the community centres and relevant stakeholders particularly with the lack of public funding and resources to achieve this goal.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
13.1 Develop this approach jointly with the community centres and relevant authorities and endorse it by all parties.	By the end of 2021	BSSR/CBR programme, community centres, disability movement and relevant authorities.		No due date

Evaluation recommendation 14: Map potential cooperation/ referral partners for training and employment.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: The centres need to develop their referral practises and networks for training and employment.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
14.1 Map local service providers, develop referral practises and sign MoUs.	--	BSSR/CBR programme, community centres, disability movement and relevant authorities.	The centres need to focus on this recommendation. CBR can help map the services through the database and promote the referral practises.	Initiated and will be regularly updated.

Evaluation recommendation 15: Explore and clarify cooperation potentials, processes as well as mutual expectations with prioritized stakeholders (i.e. the Economic Empowerment Unit) as well as external actors (i.e. MoSA Vocational Training Institutes, preferably via Economic Empowerment Unit). Agreements/ MoU's should be signed.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: This recommendation will be addressed and is very important in future interventions.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
15.1 Enhance cooperation with the EE	--	BASR programmes and	EE Programme will be part of the Strategic	Initiated and will be

Programme and utilize their services and networks.		community centres.	Workshop to review the policies, strategies, and plans of the centres.	followed up.
15.2 Seek support from EE programme to help community centres better network with relevant authorities.	--	BASR programmes and community centres.	This activity will be part of the new strategy 2022-2026.	Initiated and will be followed up.

Evaluation recommendation 16: Advocate for increased inclusiveness (and quality) of training and employment opportunities of prioritized stakeholders

Management response: Agree

Explanation: Community centres have to focus on strengthening their networks to facilitate referrals of people with disabilities to vocational and other livelihood opportunities.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
16.1 Help community centres focus on relationship building and networking.	--	BASR/CBR programme and community centres.	The education team has to support community centres to strengthen their networks. This activity will be a priority in the new strategy 2022-2026.	No due date

Evaluation recommendation 17: Increase dialogue with children/ youth as well as their families re. Occupational interests. Develop realistic but ambitious career paths, preferably involving the relevant technical expertise (i.e. Economic Empowerment Unit).

Management response: Agree

Explanation: The programme realizes the importance of career counselling for children and adults with disabilities. The EE programme has established an assessment unit, which will be utilized by the community centres.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
17.1 Refer children and adults with disabilities to the assessment unit.	--	Community centres, CBR and EE programmes.	This recommendation will be addressed in the new strategy 2022-2026	No due date

Evaluation recommendation 18: Increase community engagement and start an internships/ work exposure initiative to increase chances for successful referral and access to livelihood.

Management response: Agree				
Explanation: Community centres have to focus on strengthening their networks to facilitate referrals of people with disabilities to vocational and other livelihood opportunities.				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
18.1 Help community centres focus on relationship building and networking.	--	BASR/CBR programme and community centres.	BASR programmes will support community centres to strengthen their networks. This activity will be a priority in the new strategy 2022-2026.	No due date

Evaluation recommendation 19: Ensure reasonable accommodation for children at the centre and in facilitated internship/ training/ employment				
Management response: Agree				
Explanation: Lack of reasonable accommodation at the community centres and public premises is a real barrier to inclusion. CBR programme has focused on the adaptation/ reasonable accommodation in the programme 2017-2021 and will continue to focus on this recommendation in the new programme 2022-2026.				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
19.1 Identify and adapt public premises to facilitate access to livelihood opportunities.	--	CBR team and EE programmes and partner organizations.	This recommendation is implemented and will be continued in the new strategy 2022-2026.	Initiated and will be continued.

Evaluation recommendation 20: Ensure safeguarding measures.				
Management response: Agree				
Explanation: CBR programme will focus on promoting and endorsing safeguarding measures in the community centres. CBR programme and other relevant authorities will follow up these measures.				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
20.1 Review and update safeguarding standards	--	BASR community	An external consultant might be hired to	Initiated

with the partner community centres.		programmes and community centres.	update the safeguarding standards.	
20.2 Endorse safeguarding standards and include them as an integral part of the partnership agreements with all partners.	2021/2022	BASR admin and Directors of the community centres.	These standards will be updated in 2021 and will be followed up in the new strategy 2022-2026.	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 21: Pay salary to young adults involved in centre-based production and/ or income generation projects.

Management response: Partially Agree

Explanation: CBR programme stresses the importance of reimbursing people with disabilities working in in the centres to increase their ownership and motivation and avoid turning these centres into production workshops to cover running costs. However, the centres encounter financial challenges, which made them unable to achieve this purpose.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
21.1 CBR will urge community centres to pay a nominal monthly amount or other remuneration for the beneficiaries.	--	Community centres	This recommendation will be postponed for the new strategy 2022-2026. The programme will continue to support the centres to achieve financial sustainability.	No due date

Evaluation recommendation 22: Stop investments in new (and existing) non-sustainable training, production and income generation initiatives (priority 1: stop new, priority 2: review existing).

Management response: Disagree

Explanation: With the lack of public funding and resources, community centres are facing serious financial hardships that hinder their sustainability. The CBR programme has proposed income-generating projects as a developmental and sustainable mechanism that could help them sustain their services. These projects will be continued and regularly assessed in terms of feasibility through collaboration with a specialized company.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
21.1 Continue to offer income-generating projects based on	--	CBR programme, community centres and business development	This recommendation has been partially implemented and will be continued in the	Initiated and will be continued.

feasibility studies.		specialists/companies.	new strategy 2022-2026.	
----------------------	--	------------------------	-------------------------	--

Evaluation recommendation 23: Acknowledge the complexity of the situation, develop a realistic plan for acquisition of regular income, and focus investments/efforts on implementation of the plan.

Management response: Partially Agree

Explanation: The CBR programme has attempted several mechanisms and invested several resources to support the centres to achieve financial sustainability. The situation is complexed with the lack of public funding and the ongoing economic deterioration in the Palestinian territories. BASR will continue to look for long-lasting solutions to help them achieve this purpose.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
23.1 CBR/BASR will seek consultation from specialized individuals/companies in business development plans and sustainability.	--	BASR and community centres.	This recommendation will be further developed in the new strategy 2022-2026.	Initiated and will be regularly revised and developed.

Evaluation recommendation 24: Increase concerted advocacy for Governmental support (national level, local municipalities and public service providers), using promising practice models and putting pressure in cooperation with DPO's.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: The disability movement has to focus more on advocating the government to support the community centres as part of the education services. The MoE offers services for students with and without disabilities in the regular schools but no enough support and supervision are given to the centres.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
24.1 Continue to advocate government hold financial responsibility and support for the community centres.	--	Disability movement and community centres.	This recommendation will start in 2021 and will be continued in the new strategy.	Initiated and will be continued.

Evaluation recommendation 25: Discuss and share promising practices (Government and Private Sector Funding) in the Community Center Network. Replicate promising practice.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: Community centres have to better highlight good practices and share them with the relevant stakeholders. This will help advance the advocacy efforts and enhance accountability towards these centres.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
25.1 Share good practices through media, advocacy, and networking activities.	--	Community centres, disability movement, and CBR programme.	The CBR programme will involve disability movement in advocating for supporting the community centres by the government. This will be part of their advocacy plan that will be developed in 2021 and continued in the new programme 2022-21026.	Initiated and will be continued.
25.2 Target private sector in cooperation with EE programme to support these centres.	--	Community centres and BASR programmes.		No due date

Evaluation recommendation 26: Implement “Peer Review +”-a mechanism to identify change needs and opportunities. Start “Peer Review +”-process as soon as possible and chose first review locations strategically (i.e. promising practice Community Center with learning for others; motivating process and ownership by involved stakeholders who will promote the concept).

Management response: Agree

Explanation: This mechanism will be prioritized in the upcoming period with the community centres to discuss changes, needs, opportunities, practices through involving all actors. This mechanism will help share policies, practices and development initiatives.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
26.1 Reactivate the peer review mechanism with all community centres.	End of 2020	BASR/CBR, community centres, and the disability movement.	--	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 27: Fill the “Education Coordinator” position (filled in recommendation number 6)

Management response: Agree

Explanation: The community centre requires intensive and regular supervision and coaching. This post will be filled soon with an extra assistant to ensure the quality of supervision and outcomes.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
27.1 Develop a job description and share it with the team and other professionals.	June 2020	BASR/CBR	This task is done. The job description was consulted with BARR team and QUB team.	Completed
27.2 Conduct job exams and interviews.	June 2020	BASR/CBR	This task will be completed by the end of June 2020.	Initiated
27.3 Orient and train new employees on their roles in the programme.	July 2020	BASR/CBR	This task will be completed by the end of July 2020.	Initiated and will be regularly updated.

Evaluation recommendation 28: Restart Network Meetings in Q1 2020 to a. Discuss findings of evaluations (midterm evaluation and research Queen`s University Belfast) b. Acquire a mutual understanding of the desired future role(s) of Community Centers, assess status quo (SWOT) and agree on necessary changes. c. Identify promising practices that might be replicated. d. Continue (ongoing) training (inclusive pedagogy and other as prioritized). e. Agree on future networking (form, regularity). f. Agree on “Peer Review +” mechanism.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: These network meetings will be discussed with the staff of the community centres in the workshop, which will be conducted in July 2020.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
28.1 Discuss this proposal with the community centres.	July 2020	Education team, mental health, and community centres staff	--	Initiated
28.2 Start regular meetings with motivated staff in the new semester 2020.	September 2020	Education team, mental health, and community centres staff	--	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 29: Identify high-potential individuals and groups for political advocacy (young, energetic, sufficient time resources).

Management response: Agree

Explanation: The members of the established SHGs and DPOs have encountered a noticeable lack of motivation and commitment in the previous years. This was due to the weakness of the disability movement and their achievements in society. The evaluation results showed that some highly motivated members, increased group autonomy, concerted advocacy activities, replicated promising practices and wider dialogue and networks with relevant actors would contribute

to activate their roles in the society and bring about the desired change.				
Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
29.1 Select motivated members to the SHGs and DPOs, create alliances among active members and groups and replicate good practices.	December 2020	CBR programme, disability advocates, SHGs and DPOs.	The motivated members will be supported to create a grassroots alliance with concerted advocacy plan and celebrate achievements, which would encourage other members to join this movement.	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 30: Facilitate dialogue between political advocacy-oriented groups and GUPD. Agree on concerted advocacy with clear mutual expectations, roles and coordination (facilitated by BASR).

Management response: Agree
Explanation: SHGs and GUPDs are not in an integrated relationship. Conflict of interests between the 2 entities always occur. The CBR will make every effort to unify and organize the disability movement in the targeted local communities.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
30.1 Conduct meetings with SHGs, DPOs and GUPwDs to create a consorted advocacy plan.	--	Disability rights officer and disability advocates.	This recommendation will be addressed in 2021 and will continue to be a priority in the new strategy 2022-2026.	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 31: Share and celebrate promising practice and success publicly to create replicable models and create a more positive image of the GUPD as a partner in advocacy and vice versa.

Management response: Agree
Explanation: Replication of the disability movement achievements among all active actors will be implemented to create a positive image about their roles in the community and motivate other members and groups to be engaged in the advocacy efforts.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due

				date)
31.1 Conduct joint activities/ initiatives with GUPwDs to promote synergy and advocacy and replicate good models.	--	SHGs, DPOs, GUPwDs and CBR.	This recommendation is followed up by the Disability Rights Officer and will be pursued in the upcoming plans.	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 32: Rights holders and their families seeking services by the CBR Programme Team (CBR Workers, Community Centers, other) should receive information on existing Self-Help Groups, DPO's and Women's Groups in the area. Ensure all persons with disabilities are registered with the CBR Worker.

Management response: Agree

Explanation: Better information sharing about the SHGs and their roles in the community is needed with the right holders and families. The CBR will promote the visibility of the SHGs in the local communities.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
32.1 Promote the visibility of the SHGs through individual and community activities.	--	Disability Rights Officer and CBR workers		Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 33: Specify the key purpose and targeted users of National Resource Center.

Management response: Partially Agree

Explanation: CBR has a written action plan that identifies the interventions and measures that have to be in place to transform into a resource centre for disability. The plan included building the capacity of the staff, developing the management tools, developing accessible resources, enhancing networks and partnerships, and upgrading the information system. Now the programme has a well-established web-based application, which had better maintain the beneficiaries' files and document individual and group activities. The programme has to review and update the plan regularly to measure the progress of achievement.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
33.1 Conduct periodic review for the resource centre plan with the relevant staff and partners.	August 2020	CBR team and partners.	-	Initiated

Evaluation recommendation 34: Identify resources and services in line with (realistic) capacities.

Management response: Agree**Explanation:** The CBR has a resource development plan that is realistic and attainable. This plan needs to be regularly revised and updated.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
34.1 Conduct periodic review for the resource centre plan with the relevant staff and partners and ensure the plan is realistic and attainable.	August 2020	CBR team and partners.	The plan will include indicators to monitor the progress.	Initiated and will be regularly revised and updated.

Evaluation recommendation 35: Develop an action plan for further developing the centre (with the participation of BASR partners/ targeted users to ensure relevance and effective utilization).**Management response: Partially Agree****Explanation:** This plan needs to be regularly revised and updated.

Key action(s)	Completion date	Responsible	Tracking*	
			Comments	Status (initiated, completed or no due date)
35.1 Conduct periodic review for the resource centre plan with the relevant staff and partners.	August 2020	CBR team and partners.	Partners will be part of the revision/update process.	Initiated